Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN:** <u>2988-1641</u> <u>https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index</u>

Entrenching CALL for English Language Multicultural Pedagogy in Nigerian Secondary Schools: Issues, Prospects and Perceptions of Critical Stakeholders in Osun State, Nigeria

Mohammed Ademilokun¹, Anthony Adejuwon², Lara Olarewaju³

^{1,2,3}Obafemi Awolowo University,

Address: Ile, Ife 220103, Osun, Nigeria

Corresponding author: mohmilokun@yahoo.com

Submission Track:

Received: 31-08-2024, Final Revision: 11-11-2024, Available Online: 11-11-2024

Copyright © 20xx Authors



This work is licensed under a <u>Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International</u> License.

ABSTRACT

This paper examines the possibility of adopting Computer-Assisted Language Learning (CALL) in secondary schools in Osun State of Nigeria in the light of recent developments necessitating greater familiarity with the computer by the students for their external examinations. The paper argues that secondary school students are now more positioned than ever to harness the benefits of CALL in developing the necessary competencies to excel in their English language exams and generally develop adequate proficiency in the language for their growth in the Nigerian nation and beyond. Data for the study comprise responses to questionnaires designed for secondary school students, English language teachers and Ministry of Education senior officials in Osun State Nigeria. The sample comprised 120 students across the three senatorial districts in Osun State, 36 teachers and 15 Ministry of Education officials. Data analysis revealed great awareness of CALL among all the categories of subjects. In addition, the subjects emphasize the potential agency of CALL for enhancing the delivery of English language topics and the professional development of teachers, even though about 30 percent of the teachers sampled doubted its feasibility. The study, therefore, concludes that given the positive disposition of students to the introduction of CALL for English language teaching and being primary actors in the education process, there is a need for its immediate full-fledged adoption for English language teaching in Nigerian secondary schools.

Keywords: English language, pedagogy, CALL, secondary schools, Osun State, Nigeria

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN:** <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

INTRODUCTION

The English language remains essentially tied to the success of the average Nigerian who pursues a career in the formal sector or wishes to excel in his or her private business. This awareness continues to drive the continuous efforts at exposing Nigerians right from infancy to the language to attain remarkable proficiency, which will serve as an advantage later in their studies and work lives. This reality has been stressed by many scholars who have examined the roles and functions of English in Nigeria (e.g. Olorunsogo 2019; Adegbite 2020, etc.). Given this reality, English language not only occupies a pride of place in the primary school curriculum but is also enshrined in the secondary school curriculum of Nigerian children as it continues to be the medium of instruction and an important subject for admission into tertiary institutions (Njoku, 2017). Even at the tertiary level, every university student takes a Use of English course which must be passed apart from the fact that English language is an important course in the Faculty of Humanities in all Nigerian tertiary institutions with high enrolment annually.

However, in spite of the attention given to the language in the formal educational sector and at the personal level by parents, one still observes a general decline in the quality of English used among Nigerian students. This has been attested to by scholars such as Oribabor (2014), Okpala (2023), among many others. Oribabor (ibid) asserted that factors responsible for the poor mastery of English by Nigerian students include poor environmental conditions, unseriousness of students, lack of desire to partake in extracurricular activities, among many others.

Therefore, there is need for concerted efforts to arrest the decline of English, especially among secondary school students in Nigeria. This is borne out of the fact that the secondary school level is crucial and critical as it accounts for the significant part of the children's formative years. Furthermore, the examinations that the students will take at the level, especially Ordinary Level English Language and other subjects taught in English will

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN:** <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

determine the future of the students being pre-requisites for their admission into higher institutions of learning.

In our bid to mitigate the deterioration of English language competencies of Nigerian secondary school students, we are interested in the potentiality of computer-assisted language learning (CALL) for enhancing the prowess and abilities of Nigerian secondary school students in the English language. Our fascination with the resourcefulness of CALL in tackling the decline of English of secondary school stems from the provisions of CALL to assist language learning in line with the views of Filani (2014) and Aremu et al. (2024), and the fact that the resources for CALL are increasingly at the beck and call of the students. Apart from the fact that Nigerian secondary school students have greater access to computers owing to general exposure, many more private secondary schools are using Information and Computer Technologies to teach various subjects to students. Most importantly, the recent pronouncement by the West African Examinations Council (WAEC) that starting from 2024, they would be conducting their examinations using computer-based tests/examinations is a great impetus for the use of computers for learning English (see WAEC begins computer based exams 2024 (punching.com), as frantic efforts are being made to saturate schools, especially in Osun State, our focus, with computers in preparation for the new form of examination. This pronouncement by WAEC is expected to re-shape the secondary school education landscape in Osun State and Nigeria at large, as the government and school owners will pay greater attention to the use of computers and internet technology for the education of students. In this wise, CALL, which scholars have asserted offers numerous benefits for language advancement and development of students will come in handy. In any case, there is no doubt greater access to computers for social media involvement by the students in view of the overwhelming involvement of teenagers in the social media space in Nigeria. Therefore, forcing them to now use computer resources for their English language education will amount to re-prioritizing English language education for the students.

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN**: <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

It is arising from the above expressed new affordances and popularity of computers for general education for secondary school students in Nigeria that this study examines the perceptions of relevant stakeholders in the teaching of English language at the secondary school level in Osun State Nigeria: students, teachers and policymakers (government officials) on the potentiality of operationalization of CALL and successful performance for English language instruction in secondary schools in Osun State, Nigeria.

Some Perspectives on English Language Teaching and Computer Technology

The teaching of languages, mainly foreign or second languages –including English, in the twenty-first century, is expectedly different from what it used to be many years ago in many parts of the world. This was well captured by Parvin and Salam (2015, p.47), citing Eaton (2010) when they remarked that "the field of language education is ever-changing ...as language classrooms are vastly different from that of the mid – to late twentieth century". In many parts of the world and even in some parts of Nigeria, there is a departure from traditional rote learning, grammar, and memorization to learning in a communicative manner that is culturally grounded. In fact, Shadiev and Wang (2022) remarked that modern society needs language learning and teaching plans to be tailored towards equipping learners with crucial twenty-first-century skills such as the four Cs (critical thinking, communication, creativity, and collaboration), digital literacy skills and career and life skills. A close look at the crucial skills of the twenty-first century shows that digital literacy is quite important. To develop digital literacy, it is evident that one must be familiar with and proficient in the use of computers, thus justifying the importance of injecting computer technology into language teaching and learning.

Scholars have examined the different ways in which technology can be used and has been used for language teaching, especially in the developed world. According to Zhang and Zou (2020), mobile learning, multimedia learning, socialization, voice-to-text recognition, text-to-speech recognition, and digital game-based learning are various forms of technology-driven language teaching methods. In all of these, technological devices such as computers,

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN**: <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

tablets, mobile phones, billboards, television sets, video games, among others, are prominent technological resources that are being used for language teaching and learning.

Indeed, the various efforts at using technology for language teaching are not futile as there have been documented results in the literature. For instance, Garcia-Sanchez and Burbules (2016) reported that online collaborative tasks improve important skills of students such as problem-solving, collaboration and speaking. This is quite understandable as the use of computer technologies requires students to solve problems they encounter in their usage of the technologies while computer resources enhance collaboration among youngsters, just as many technological resources enable students to hone their speaking. Also, Chiang (2020) reported that digital storytelling enhances language learners' writing abilities. In addition to Chiang's observation, we also opine that digital story writing will motivate learners and contribute to their reading capacity. It is evident that there are indeed numerous opportunities and advantages that technology affords language teaching and learning, especially the teaching and learning of English.

While there are many technological resources for English language teaching as earlier remarked, our focus in this paper is on computers. This is because we are interested in the application and use of computer-assisted language learning for the teaching of the English language to secondary school students in Osun State. Computer-assisted language learning is no doubt a product of the interaction between language teaching and technology. According to Singh (2015), semblances of CALL date back to the 1960s, even though in reality, CALL in its highly developed form manifested in the early 1990s. There have been various stages in the development of CALL in its employment in the Western nations, especially United States of America, as there have been behavioristic CALL, communicative CALL and integrative CALL. Singh (ibid) remarked that behavioristic CALL could be said to be the earliest form of CALL, drawing heavily on the behavioristic theory of language learning and thus focusing on drills and repetitions of words and sounds on computers. Yamazaki (2014) reported that communicative CALL came as a result of criticisms against behavioristic CALL and sought to promote the use of computers for teaching languages,

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN**: <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

especially English in a manner that one does not only teach forms but teaches how to use the language with computers. Subsequently, the criticism of communicative CALL also birthed integrative CALL as language scholars and teachers sought to teach the various language skills of listening, speaking, reading and writing as a whole using computers (Yamazaki ibid; Abhigyan & Abhigyan, 2022).

However, while there have been serious advances in the deployment of CALL in the developed nations, Nigeria is still lagging behind in the optimisation of the potentialities of CALL for language teaching and computer literacy among students. Specifically, English pedagogy at the primary and secondary school levels in Nigeria has not really been influenced by the affordances of CALL. This reality is counter-productive for the efforts on the deepening of the awareness of the English language among those categories of learners of the language in Nigeria in view of the positive reports by scholars on the affordances of CALL for English pedagogy in different national milieus. For instance, Zheltukhina et al. (2023) remarked that technology enables students to learn languages better as it enhances learners' writing and other language skills. They also report that language-learning websites and mobile apps are important technological tools employed as teaching tools in groups or individually and as a tool for communication for students and teachers. Most remarkably, Zheltukhina et al. (ibid) avowed that the technological resources ensure cooperation among language learners and their teachers, thus further enhancing successful learning of the language. In another study on the usefulness of CALL for language instruction, Kfryawan (2023) asserted that computer-assisted language learning is really effective as it improves Papuans' English language proficiency.

In the Nigerian context, Olibie (2010) and Filani (2014) have given some attention to CALL in the Nigerian educational space. Olibie (ibid), for instance, attempted to examine the efficacy of CALL for improving students' performance in English at the universal basic education level in Delta State of Nigeria. Using a control group and an experimental group, the study showed that CALL positively influenced students' achievement in English. Thus,

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN:** <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

The author suggested that schools with computers should encourage English teachers to use CALL.

On his part, Filani (2014) examined CALL and its implications for English language learning in Nigerian public universities. He avers that computer and its attendant resources have a lot to offer language teaching and learning in Nigeria. He further remarks that English language instructors in Nigerian universities must embrace CALL as it should be adopted for teaching English in Nigerian universities.

While Olibie's study sheds some light on the potential success of CALL in the Nigerian context, it focuses on the primary school level and, at most, elementary secondary school, as well as Delta State. On the other hand, even though Filani (2014) articulated the importance of CALL, he strictly focused on its deployment at the university level in Nigeria. This study therefore seeks to deepen the examination of the potentialities of CALL in enhancing English language instruction and understanding among senior secondary school students in Nigeria by focusing on the possibility of adoption of CALL for English language pedagogy at the secondary school level in Osun State of Nigeria. This became expedient in the light of the impending necessity of students having to write their external examinations electronically through computers. The study specifically seeks to ex-ray the perspectives of critical stakeholders required for the pursuit of such CALL initiative in the educational landscape of Osun State of Nigeria: students, teachers and ministry of education officials.

We particularly believe that CALL has greater effectiveness in improving students' language proficiency than the other traditional methods of teaching the English language found in Nigerian secondary schools, especially the grammar translation approach. This is because CALL enhances the development of critical skills such as writing and speaking, among others. At a time when books are more expensive to purchase by Nigerian parents for their children, digital literature which CALL exposes students to will enable children to develop their written English as they will learn and be exposed to different writing styles

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN:** <u>2988-1641</u>

https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

through their engagement with different online books. In addition, new forms of writing which are not taught through traditional modes of teaching in Nigeria, such as blog writing, social media writing, among many others which are highly lucrative now and sharpen the creative, expository, analytical and critical writing skills of students will be learnt by the students making them more proficient in written English. Kafryawan (2023) also emphasises that computer-assisted language learning will significantly improve students' language proficiency through its affordances for corpus linguistics, enabling students to access wide corpora in English. By paying attention to corpora of authentic written and spoken English, especially of native speakers of English Language, students will be able to internalise meaningful and correct expressions in chunks which they can use to write and speak accordingly.

Also, for spoken English, in addition to the benefits accruable to students taught through corpora from CALL, students will get involved in authentic communication through different online platforms for communication such as zoom, google meets, Whatsapp, among others, which make them to speak the English language in a more relaxed manner as they lose their inhibition more in social media environments. So, with proper monitoring, students learn how to speak English on a broad range of topics and about digital technology through CALL.

In view of the numerous benefits of CALL, this study therefore seeks to examine the potentiality of its adoption in Osun State of Nigeria's secondary schools in line with the perspectives of critical stakeholders on the matter: students, teachers and policymakers. The study intends to answer the question on the stakeholders' attitudes to adopting CALL and its feasibility in secondary schools in the state.

Theoretical Framework

This study draws insights from the socio-constructivist approach to language learning. The theory which Vygotsky pioneered emphasises learner-centredness and that learning a

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN:** <u>2988-1641</u> <u>https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index</u>

language must not be in a vacuum as language learning should be situated in a social milieu. Pathan et al. (2018) echoed the idea of learner-centredness when he states that learning is generally more productive when the methodology and study mode are designed to be skewed towards the learners' preference. Akpan et al. (2020, p.51) described the nature of learner-centredness in social constructivism by stating that "all learning tasks (irrespective of the difficulty), can be performed by learners under adult guidance or with peer collaboration". This kind of perception about learning is very apt for introducing CALL to Osun secondary schools in Nigeria because many students tend to even know more about computers than the teachers teaching them. This is consequent upon the fact that while many teachers are recruited to teach English Language without computer knowledge and skills, a lot of students are exposed to computer technology through peer influence and their parents. Therefore, just as the students will be learning about the English language skills that teachers will expose them to through CALL, the teachers themselves will learn more about computers through the students.

Furthermore, the socio-constructivist theoretical grounding of the study allows for the explication of the socio-economic situation of the context of the study, Osun State, especially the peculiarities of the government schools and the private schools. Regarding the public schools, it is evident that the Osun State government is mainly responsible for providing the infrastructures necessary for the actualisation of CALL as a teaching method for English teaching. This is not expected to be difficult for the government given the attention it is giving to human capital development and education in recent times. Moreover, the provision of computers for the deployment of CALL at schools will also aid the teaching and learning of other subjects as the schools can use the equipment for the teaching and learning of other subjects. Furthermore, the removal of fuel subsidy in Nigeria in recent times has enriched the sub-nationals in Nigeria, including Osun State. The promise for the removal of fuel subsidy was that monies accruing from the subsidy removal would be channeled to education and infrastructures.

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN**: <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

For the private schools, we may experience cases of socio-economic disparities affecting the many access of students to CALL as some of the small private schools or those in the rural areas may find it difficult to put in place the infrastructures needed for the deployment of CALL. However, such schools can enter into an arrangement with bigger privates with computer facilities or nearby government schools equipped by the state government. In any case, the inevitability of the use of computers in Nigerian secondary schools is emphasised by the adoption of computer based exams by external examination bodies in Nigeria. And in the even that some private schools are unable to meet up, parents of the students of such schools can withdraw them from such schools and enrol them in government schools that are well funded.

RESEARCH METHODS

The population for the study comprises senior secondary school students, teachers, and Ministry of Education officials in Osun State, Nigeria. However, the sample for the study comprises 120 senior secondary school students, thirty-six English language teachers, and fifteen Ministry of Education staff in Osun State, Nigeria. To draw the subjects, we focused on the three senatorial districts in the state by obtaining data from equal numbers of subjects from the senatorial districts: Osun East, Osun West and Osun Central. Therefore, we obtained data from ten students each in four schools in each senatorial district, two private secondary schools and two public secondary schools, making a total of 120 students. The schools were purposively selected being major public and private schools in the senatorial districts and questionnaire was used to obtain the views of the subjects. The students selected are male and female and are of mixed abilities: strong, average and weak. They average fifteen years of age. Also, three teachers were drawn from the two public and two private schools in each of the three senatorial districts, making thirty-six teachers as subjects. Questionnaire was also used to obtain data from the teachers as it was distributed to thirty-six teachers across the three senatorial districts in the state. Finally, to obtain the views of the policymakers, since there are three zones of the body coordinating secondary school education in Osun

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN**: <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

State, we obtained data from five Ministry of Education officials in each of the three zones, making a total of fifteen Ministry of Education officials as subjects. Questionnaire was also used to obtain data from the Ministry of Education staff. Different questionnaires were used to obtain information from the different categories of the subjects (teachers, students and policymakers), even though similar questions were sometimes asked in the questionnaires. We obtained the consent and permission of the school authorities, teachers, and students of the respective schools, as well as the Ministry of Education and Osun State staff. After the data collection, we analyzed the subjects' views on the questions posed to them and carried out a percentage analysis of such views.

Here, we present the major questions in the questionnaires for the subjects. The questionnaires were adapted from the questionnaires used by Ademilokun (2016) in his study on perceptions of code-switching as a pedagogical tool in secondary schools science classrooms in Nigeria. We designed the questions by ourselves based on Ademilokun (ibid) and our awareness of the most pertinent issues regarding the applicability of CALL for teaching English language in Nigerian secondary schools. Below are the major questions in the questionnaires for the students, teachers of English and Ministry of Education staff:

Questionnaire for Students

- 1. Are you aware of computer assisted language learning (CALL)?
- 2. Do you think CALL can enable you learn the English language better?
- 3. Do you think CALL is feasible here in Nigeria?
- 4. Do you think the government can provide resources for CALL at your school?
- 5. Do you think the recent announcement that the West African Examinations Council (WAEC) that examinations will now be conducted using computers will enable you to use computers more for the learning of English?

Questionnaire for Teachers

- 1. Are you aware of computer assisted language learning?
- 2. Do you think CALL can enable you to better deliver the contents you teach to students?

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN**: <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

- 3. Do you know CALL can assist your continuous professional development as a teacher?
- 4. Do you think CALL is feasible here in Nigeria?
- 5. Do you think the government can provide resources for CALL at your schools?
- 6. Do you think the recent announcement that the West African Examinations Council (WAEC) that examinations will now be conducted using computers is a catalyst for the entrenchment of CALL in Nigeria?

Questionnaire for Ministry Workers

- 1. Are you aware of computer assisted language learning?
- 2. Do you think CALL can enable English teachers deliver their contents better?
- 3. Do you think CALL can assist the professional development of Osun English teachers?
- 4. Do you think CALL is feasible in Nigeria?
- 5. Can the government finance CALL in our schools?
- 6. Do you think the recent announcement by WAEC that exams will now be conducted using computers is a catalyst for the entrenchment of CALL in Nigeria?

RESULTS & DISCUSSION

This section presents analysis and discussion of key findings of the study. The analysis is layered based on the various types of information on the potentiality of the adoption of computer assisted language learning elicited from the students. The analysis focuses on the perspectives of the subjects on their awareness of CALL and its efficiency, feasibility of CALL for English language pedagogy in Osun State secondary schools and Nigeria in general and the impact of the recently introduced use of computers for external secondary school exams in Nigeria for English language teaching.

Table 1: Awareness of CALL among Students and their Perceptions on its Efficiency

Research Question	School	Yes	Yes	No	No
		No	%	No	%
Are you aware of CALL?	A (O.A.U. International	4	40	6	60
	School)				
	B (Faith Standard School)	10	100	0	0
	C (St John's Grammar School)	7	70	3	30

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN:** 2988-1641 https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

	D (Ansar-ur-deen Grammar School)	6	60	4	40
	E (Good Tidings School)	8	80	2	20
	F (C.A.C. Grammar School)	9	90	1	10
	G (Ataoja School of Science)	3	30	7	70
	H (Olive Branch School)	8	80	2	20
	I (Omowumi Comprehensive College)	9	90	1	10
	J (Ede High School)	7	70	3	30
	K (Adventist Grammar School)	8	80	2	20
	L (Al-Fareed College)	8	80	2	20
	Total	87	72.5	33	27.5
Do you think CALL can enable you		Yes	Yes	No	No
learn English language better?		No	%	No	%
	A	8	80	2	20
	В	10	100	0	0
	С	10	100	0	0
	D	10	100	0	0
	Е	9	90	1	10
	F	10	100	0	0
	G	10	100	0	0
	Н	10	100	0	0
	1	8	80	2	20
	J	8	80	2	20
	K	10	100	0	0
	L	10	100	0	0
	Total	113	94	07	6

Table one above shows that the students are generally optimistic about CALL and its ability to enhance their learning of the English language. While a total of 72.5% of the subjects aver that they are aware of CALL, only 27.5 % indicate that they are yet to know about it, showing that a large number of students in Osun secondary schools and by extension Nigeria have learnt about CALL. In fact, it is interesting that both students of private and public secondary schools are aware of CALL as there is only a slight difference in

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN:** <u>2988-1641</u> <u>https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index</u>

their level of awareness of it with 46% of the 77 students that claimed they know about CALL being public school students while 54% are private school students. This is an indication that CALL is of interest to students of both public and private schools in Nigeria. This shows a marked improvement and departure from the study of Adejumo et al. (2016) which reported that only 20% of the students they sampled in eight secondary schools across Lagos, Ogun states indicated that they had considerable awareness of CALL. This difference in the awareness levels of CALL of the students in our study (Osun secondary school students) and the students in their study can be premised on that time difference of the studies as one expects that with greater exposure of students to technology in recent years, there is the tendency for them to know more about CALL. Another factor that one can adduce for the overwhelming awareness of CALL demonstrated by the Osun secondary school students in our study is the previous project of "Opon Imo" (tablet of knowledge) distributed by Osun State Government in the past few years.

With respect to whether CALL can enhance the learning of English language by students, 94% of the subjects enthused that CALL can indeed assist them to learn English language better while only a tiny 6% of the subjects posited that CALL cannot be beneficial to them. This shows that the students are not only aware of CALL but are confident that it will aid their learning of the English language. It is remarkable even that both categories of students - private schools and public schools - showed their belief in the ability of CALL to aid their development in the use of the English language. This positive disposition of the students on the potentiality of CALL to enhance their learning of English aligns with the perspectives of the student subjects in Adejumo et al. (2016) where the students (99%) overwhelmingly enthused that CALL can trigger successful learning of English in them. Therefore, it is evident that students as primary stakeholders on the adoption of CALL for English language teaching in Nigerian secondary schools believe CALL is productive and helpful.

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN:** <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

Table 2: Awareness of CALL among Teachers and their Perceptions on its Efficiency

Research Questions	Yes No	Yes %	No No	No %
Are you aware of CALL?	29	81	7	19
Do you think CALL can enable you deliver better?	29	81	7	19
Do you think CALL can enhance your professional development?	31	86	5	14

Table 2 above shows the level of awareness of CALL among secondary school teachers and their perceptions on its potentiality to enhance their pedagogy and career development. With respect to their awareness of CALL, 29 (81%) out of the 36 sampled teachers indicated that they are fully aware of CALL while 7(19%) of the subjects indicated that they do not know about CALL. This shows that Nigerian secondary school English teachers are generally aware of CALL even though some of them are still laid back and need to be exposed to new methods in CALL.

On whether CALL can empower the teachers to deliver their English language contents to the students, it is interesting that 81% of the teachers again indicated that they believe in the power of CALL to enhance the delivery of their English lessons to their students while 19% indicated otherwise as is the case on the level of awareness of CALL among teachers. This shows that the teachers are indeed conscious as expected as their responses are consistent. It also shows that there is a need for training of all teachers of English in Osun State and Nigeria to expose them to the affordances of CALL for their greater efficiency as teachers of English language. This finding on the positive attitude of Osun State of Nigeria's English language teachers to CALL is consistent with the findings of Tafazoli, Parra and Huertas-Abril (2019, p.36) who reported that Iranian and Spanish teachers "understand the critical role of CALL in their professional and daily lives". This shows that Nigerian teachers of English are not left behind in the universal acceptance of CALL for professional delivery and personal development.

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN**: 2988-1641 https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

In order to highlight the importance of CALL for the career development of the teachers themselves, this study also sought to examine the teachers' perspectives on the role of CALL in enhancing their professional development. Remarkably, even a greater percentage of the teachers compared to their responses to earlier questions showed that CALL can facilitate their professional development. 86% of the teacher subjects indicated that they believe CALL can assist their professional growth, showing that the teachers are intrinsically motivated to adopt CALL in view of its affordances for their job performances and career growth. This shows that the teachers are indeed open to the introduction of CALL as they will gladly welcome it if fully introduced into secondary school education in Osun State and Nigeria as a whole. This aligns with the findings of Basoz and Cubukcu (2014) where pre-service teachers enthused that CALL can improve their professional development by enriching their vocabulary, improving their listening skills and sharpening their intelligence for greater delivery to students. The finding on the belief of Nigerian teachers that CALL can enhance their professional development is also in tandem with the findings of Kim (2022) who reported that CALL can enhance their professional development through its provision of new experience for teachers and students with digital devices, practical and easy assessment, among others.

Table 3: Awareness of CALL among Policymakers on Education and their Perceptions on its Efficiency

Research Questions	Yes	Yes	No	No
	No	%	No	%
Are you aware of CALL?	12	80	3	20
Do you think CALL can enable teachers to deliver their contents better?	11	73	4	27
Do you believe CALL can assist the professional development of Osun English teachers?	13	87	2	13

Table 3 above shows the level of awareness of CALL among policymakers in the Ministry of Education of Osun State of Nigeria and their perspectives on the value of CALL for English language teaching in Nigerian secondary schools and the career development of English teachers themselves. Interestingly, 80% of the subjects indicated that they are aware

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN:** <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

of CALL while 20% indicated that they are not aware of it. This shows that CALL is not even strange to policymakers in education in Osun State and Nigeria, and they only need a strong will to adopt it.

On their view regarding the ability of CALL to enable English teachers deliver their contents better, eleven (73%) out of the fifteen subjects indicated that CALL can assist English teachers to teach various aspects of English language better to secondary school students while 27% of the policymakers indicated to the contrary. This shows that while CALL is popular among policymakers on education in Nigeria, some still need to be made aware of the values inherent in using CALL for English language teaching. Interesting however, a greater number and percentage of the policymakers indicated that CALL can assist the professional development of English teachers as 87% of the subjects so indicated while only 2 out of the 15 sampled showed no such belief. This shows that almost all policymakers know that CALL has great value, even though some of them shy away from asserting that it can aid the delivery of teachers. This is contradictory as one wonders how CALL will aid professional development of teachers without translating to their improved teaching. The inference to make from the responses is thus that the policymakers overtly and covertly amplify the usefulness of CALL for English language instruction in Nigerian secondary schools for students and teachers alike.

The findings on the perceptions of educational administrators and policymakers on CALL are novel in the sense that there is a dearth of studies on the perspectives of policymakers on adoption of CALL in secondary school English language teaching which this study fills. However, one could also draw insights from Demirbilek (2023) to examine the perceptions of administrators on CALL tangentially. This is because even though Demirbilek did not directly focus on CALL, he studied the perceptions of school administrators' perceptions of distance education in Turkish schools during the Covid-19 lockdown. The study showed that the administrators did not consider distance education which entails some elements of CALL sufficient in view of the poor attitudes of the students to assignments

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN**: <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

and many other tasks. While we agree that the study did not focus solely on CALL, it offers useful insights on areas that can be given greater attention regarding the adoption of CALL in Osun State, Nigeria secondary secondary schools as the loopholes in CALL which unserious students may want to exploit have to be completely blocked.

Table 4: Perspectives of Students on Feasibility of CALL in Nigeria

Research Question	School	Yes	Yes	No	No
-		No	%	No	%
Do you think CALL is feasible in Nigeria?	A	7	70	3	30
	В	7	70	3	30
	С	8	80	2	20
	D	10	100	0	0
	Е	9	90	1	10
	F	8	80	2	20
	G	7	70	3	30
	Н	9	90	1	10
	Ι	9	90	1	10
	J	5	50	5	50
	K	8	80	2	20
	L	10	100	0	0
	Total	97	81	23	19
Do you think the government can		Yes	Yes	No	No
provide the resources for CALL?		No	%	No	%
	A	8	80	2	20
	В	6	60	4	40
	С	10	100	0	0
	D	9	90	1	10
	Е	8	80	2	20
	F	10	100	0	0
	G	9	90	1	10
	Н	10	100	0	0
	1	10	100	0	0
	J	7	70	3	30
	K	7	70	3	30
	L	9	90	1	10
	Total	103	86	17	14
Do you think the announcement by		Yes	Yes	No	No
WAEC that they will soon start CBT		No	%	No	%
exams will enable you use CALL for	A	9	90	1	10
learning English?	В	10	100	0	0
	С	10	100	0	0
	D	8	80	2	20
	Е	8	80	2	20
	F	6	60	4	40

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN**: 2988-1641 https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

G	10	100	0	0
Н	10	100	0	0
I	9	90	1	10
J	8	80	2	20
K	8	80	2	20
L	9	90	1	10
Total	105	87.5	15	12.5

Table 4 above shows that secondary school students are optimistic about the adoption of CALL in Nigeria. On whether CALL is feasible in Nigeria, 81% of the student subjects indicated it is feasible in Nigeria while 19% indicated it is not. This shows that only a few students are still doubtful of the feasibility of CALL in Nigeria and such people can be convinced that CALL can be made possible in Nigeria. In fact, it is interesting that both public and private secondary school students actively expressed the view that CALL is feasible as out of the 97 students that so indicated, 52.5 are private school students while 47.5 are public school students, showing a marginal difference. This clearly reveals that both sets of students believe that CALL can work for their learning of English and are prepared for its adoption. This finding on students' optimism on the feasibility of CALL is consistent with the finding of Aremu et al. (2024) who reported that once the obstacles in the way of CALL are removed, CALL is feasible in Nigeria.

On whether the government has the capacity to provide the resources for CALL, 86% of the students strongly enthused that the government has what it takes to provide the resources for the use of CALL for teaching English language in Osun State of Nigeria's secondary schools. This even shows a marginal increase in the percentage of subjects who support the feasibility of CALL in Osun secondary schools, giving one the impression that the students are indeed positive about the adoption of CALL and are only awaiting the decision and action of the government regarding the adoption of CALL for the teaching of English Language. It is interesting that the position of the students on the ability of the government to provide the resources for CALL is echoed by Aremu et al. (2024) and Adejumo et al. (2016) who simply believe that the government has what it takes to procure the equipment for the

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN**: <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

implementation of CALL and should go ahead to so for its full implementation in Nigerian senior secondary schools.

The study further brought the recent announcement by the West African Examinations Council (WAEC) into perspective on whether it can contribute to the use of CALL in Nigeria by making it more feasible and plausible. Therefore, we sought information from students on their perceptions on how the adoption of computer-based examinations by one of the highest external bodies examining them and the students showed great awareness of the impact of the development on the deployment of CALL for enhancing English language pedagogy in Nigerian schools. A total of 105 (87.5) out of the 120 students sampled indicated that the new development from WAEC will further assist the embrace of CALL for the teaching of English in Nigerian schools while only 12.5 percent of the students objected to the idea. Again, further analysis of the responses of the students indicates that the two categories of students in focus - private school students and public-school students - are united in their position that the new reality of the conduct WAEC examinations using computers is a needed tonic for CALL as it will boost its adoption and use for English language teaching in Nigeria. While 52 percent of the students that believe in the positive impact of the new WAEC CBT exams on adoption and use of CALL are private secondary school students, 48 percent of them are public secondary school students. This shows that both private and public secondary school students are mindful of the fact that CALL is the direction for English language pedagogy in Nigeria in the immediate future. This finding aligns with Okah-Tim (2023), who maintained that the introduction of computer-based tests has created more awareness about computer-assisted instruction, making learning and teaching easier for Nigerians.

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN**: <u>2988-1641</u> <u>https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index</u>

Table 5: Perceptions of Teachers on the Feasibility of CALL in Nigeria

Research Questions	Yes	Yes	No	No
	No	%	No	%
Do you think CALL is feasible in Nigeria?	24	67	12	33
Do you think government can provide resources for CALL at your schools?	30	83	6	17
	24	67	12	33
use of computers for exams will assist entrenchment of				
CALL in Osun State and Nigeria?				

Table 5 above shows the views of secondary schools teachers in Osun State of Nigeria on the feasibility of adoption of CALL for English language teaching at secondary schools in the state and Nigeria at large. The results show that the teachers are not as optimistic as the students on the adoption of CALL even too a great fraction of them also believe in the feasibility of CALL in Nigeria. For instance, on the first question about the feasibility of CALL in Nigeria, 67% of the teacher respondents indicate that CALL is feasible in Nigeria while 33% percent indicate that it is not feasible. This shows that two over third of the teachers believe CALL is feasible in Nigeria, showing that many teachers are well disposed to CALL even though there is greater need for sensitisation and awareness creation about the benefits in the use of CALL for Nigerian English language teachers. This aligns with the findings of Aremu et al. (2024) who emphasised the feasibility of CALL once the enabling environment is created.

On whether the government can provide resources for CALL at schools, it is interesting that a greater number of the teachers believe that the government can indeed provide materials for the adoption of CALL, as 83% of the teachers so indicated with only 17% indicating to the contrary. This shows that the teachers do not believe that government funding and provision of computers and other materials will impede the feasibility of CALL in Nigeria. This is consistent with Aremu et al.'s (2024) and Adejumo et al. (2016) positions. This indicates that the teachers may think there are other impediments in the actualisation

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN**: <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

of CALL for English language teaching in Nigeria. But at least, the responses of the teachers indicate that an important part of the feasibility of CALL in Nigeria can be met.

The teachers also reflected on the impact of the announcement by WAEC that all examinations including English Language will now be conducted through the use of computers. On this, 67% of the teachers indicated that the development is a catalyst for the embrace of CALL in Nigerian secondary schools while 33% indicate that such a development does not necessarily translate to the adoption of CALL in Nigerian secondary schools for the teaching of English. The fact that a greater percentage of the subjects believe the WAEC announcement can catalyse the adoption of CALL in Nigerian secondary schools shows that there is glimmering hope for the eventual adoption of CALL in Nigerian schools.

Table 6: Feasibility of CALL in Nigerian Secondary Schools: Policymakers' Take

Research Questions	Yes	Yes	No	No
	No	%	No	%
Do you think CALL is feasible in Nigeria?	9	60	6	40
Do you think government can provide resources for CALL at schools?	14	93	1	7
Do you think the recent announcement by WAEC that exams will now be conducted using computers is a catalyst for the entrenchment of CALL in Nigeria?	11	73	4	27

Table 6 above shows parallels in the perspectives of teachers and policymakers on the feasibility of CALL in Nigerian secondary schools. For instance, while 60% of the policymakers indicated that CALL is feasible in Nigeria, 40% indicated it is not. This is close to the views of the teachers on the subject as 67% of the teachers indicated that it is feasible. This shows that the position of the teachers is close to that of the policymakers on the matter.

Also, a close look at the responses of the policymakers to the question on whether government in Nigeria can provide resources for CALL at schools shows that just as teachers believe that the government can provide resources for CALL, 93% of the policymakers indicate that the government can provide resources for CALL. This shows that the

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN**: <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

policymakers being close to government believe that the government has all it takes to provide materials for the adoption of CALL. In fact, the policymakers enthused that the educational policies of Osun State government which prioritise total education of children recognises the place of computer technology for the education of students in secondary schools. Since the state is at the forefront of the STEM (Science, Technology and Mathematics) education campaign, the government is keen on making available computers not only for the adoption of CALL but also for the teaching of computer science and other subjects whose teaching can be aided by computers. In fact, the policymakers drew attention to the policy of *Opon Imo* (Computers of knowledge), which involves the distribution of smart tablets to students for the learning of English and other subjects in public secondary schools in Osun State. The project was embarked upon by a recent past administration in Osun State, and many students are still using the tablets. Thus, the policymakers that make up the government of the day can reinvigorate the effort by providing computers for CALL and teaching other subjects. Therefore, this study re-echoes the findings of Aremu et al. (2024) and Adejumo et al. (2016) who believe that the government can provide the resouces for the operationalisation of CALL in Nigerian secondary schools. Furthermore, just as we stated earlier, policymakers insinuate that other factors may work against the implementation of CALL apart from the provision of resources by the government.

On whether the new policy by WAEC to conduct its external examinations with computers will catalyse the entrenchment of CALL in Nigerian secondary schools, 73% of the subjects indicated that truly the development will catalyse the adoption of CALL in Nigerian schools while 27% think otherwise. This shows that while there is work to be done on the mindset of the policymakers, especially those who do not particularly embrace call, there are indeed signs that CALL has a bright future in secondary school education in Osun State and Nigeria in general. This is in tandem with the position of Okah-Tim that the conduct of computer-based tests will strengthen computer-assisted instruction, which, in turn, will make teaching and learning various subjects, including the English language, easier.

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN**: <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

CONCLUSION & RECOMMENDATION

The paper has revealed the attitudes of stakeholders (students, teachers, and policymakers) to the adoption of CALL for the teaching of English to secondary school students in Osun State, Nigeria, and has addressed various aspects of its feasibility. The attitudes of the subjects can be said to be diverse with the students largely believing in the feasibility and efficacy of CALL while the teachers and policymakers expressed mixed feelings, even though a greater proportion of the two categories showed optimism on the feasibility and efficacy of CALL for the teaching of the students in Osun State. Interestingly, all the categories of the subjects equally enthused that CALL is highly workable in Osun State, Nigeria, as they aver that the government of the state can provide all the facilities necessary for its implementation.

The analysis showed that all categories of the stakeholders are significantly aware of CALL and its potentialities. We find it particularly interesting that private and public school students fully know CALL and its affordances. More significantly, an overwhelming 94% of the students enthuse that CALL can enhance their language learning and development, showing that Nigerian secondary school students are positively predisposed to CALL.

Also, it is noteworthy that both English teachers and Ministry of Education staff believe CALL can assist teachers in delivering better, just as it can enhance their professional development, validating the opinion that CALL is useful for both teachers and students alike. However, it is noteworthy that a greater percentage of students believe in the feasibility of CALL in Nigeria than the teachers. This is striking in view of the fact that the stance of many of the teachers regarding the feasibility of CALL in Nigeria contradicts their earlier position that CALL has many benefits for both teachers and students. This thus shows that there is the likelihood that many teachers are still sceptical of their abilities to quickly adjust to the demands of the use of CALL for language teaching.

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN**: <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

Of course, the teachers and the few students who express doubts over the feasibility of CALL in Nigeria adduce reasons such as poor internet service, erratic power supply, poor exposure of students to computers, unaffordability of computers, poor security at schools, inadequate funding, poor maintenance culture, mismanagement of the applications by students, inability of teachers to use it, among many others. However, we believe many of the challenges can be easily circumvented once there is the will to optimise CALL for language teaching in Nigerian secondary schools. In fact, our own position that the challenges are surmountable is further reinforced by the declaration of all the three categories of subjects - students, teachers and Ministry of Education workers, that the government can provide the resources for CALL in Nigerian schools. We corroborate this position of theirs by avowing that the implementation of CALL, though demanding, is not rocket science as many of us have deployed often deployed CALL at the higher level of language teaching and have participated in different that learning, teaching and assessment activities fruitfully drawing on CALL.

Many of the challenges identified by the teachers reported in the last paragraph can be easily surmounted. For instance, issues of poor maintenance culture and poor school security can be easily handled by a responsible school principal, who is properly monitored by the state's inspectorate of education. Similarly, erratic power supply and poor internet service can be solved by exploring alternative sources of power such as solar and using the best internet service providers for the different locations of the schools. The issue of affordability of computers and inadequate funding can also be solved by committing the government to commit a reasonable part of the education budget annually to the purchase of computers while also soliciting funds and financial assistance from alumni, corporate bodies and international organisations. Furthermore, the challenge of poor exposure of students to computers and mismanagement of computer applications by students can be solved by proper training of the students on the rightful use of computers and thorough

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN:** <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

monitoring of the students when they are using computers for the learning of English language.

A major challenge may be the integration of CALL into the pegagogies of the teachers of English language in Nigeria and Osun State in particular. One major challenge regarding this is the lack of sufficient knowledge on CALL and the use of computers by the teachers, and this can be surmounted through proper and continuous training of the teachers on the ways to use CALL in addition to other methods of teaching English for the teaching of English to secondary school students.

The position of 87% of the students, that WAEC adoption of computers for all of its examinations including English papers, further shows that there is an imminent transition to CALL for English language learning among the students. Although a lower percentage of teachers expressed the same sentiment, since the students are the ones that are primary in all of the considerations regarding the use of CALL and given the dynamism of the younger generations now, one can be assured that they will actively embrace different means of using CALL since their success in external examinations is greatly dependent on it.

Therefore, we recommend that since the students show greater positivity on adopting CALL and are the primary actors on the matter, all necessary processes should be expedited to infuse CALL into English language pedagogy at the secondary school level in Nigeria. We believe since the government of Osun State prioritises the knowledge of technology and CALL mediates language teaching and technology, they will make provision for the infrastructures and equipment needed for the deployment of CALL for the teaching of the English Language in Osun State secondary schools. We believe that the government can extend the gains of the *Opon Imo* project which was introduced by a previous government in the state and has already exposed teachers and some students to the use of computers for learning various subjects, including English language. We consider it expedient for the government to take the bull by the horn by preparing our children for the modern world

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN:** <u>2988-1641</u> <u>https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index</u>

increasingly becoming dependent on technology by exposing the students to the inherent benefits of CALL for language learning and teaching.

REFERENCES

- Abhigyan, D. & Abhigyan, S. (2022). Approaches to computer assisted language learning: A brief survey. *Universal Review*, *XIII*(2), 1-8.
- Adegbite, W. (2020). *Sociolinguistics and the sociology of English in Nigeria*. Obafemi Awolowo University Press.
- Adejumo, G.O., Abioye, T.O. & Tar, M. (2016). Adoption of computer assisted language learning software among Nigerian secondary school students. *Covenant International Journal of Psychology*, 1(2), 22-30.
- Adeosun, I.O, Sulaiman, F.R & Solagberu, A.O. (2022). The use of mother tongue as a medium of instruction in selected pre-primary and primary schools in Ijebu-East local government area of Ogun State. *Al-Hikmah Journal of Arts and Social Sciences Education*, 4(2), 31-42.
- Adepoju, B.H. (2019). An appraisal of the mother tongue for early child education in Nigeria. *Transitions: Journal of Transient Migration*, *3*(2), 201-220.
- Akpan, V., Igwe, U., Blessing, I, Mpamah, I. & Okoro, C.O. (2020). Social constructivism: Implications on teaching and learning. *British Journal of Education*, *8*(8),49-56.
- Aremu, M.A., Odekunbi, K. & Adelabu, I. (2024). Use of electronic devices in the teaching and learning of the English language in Oyo State senior secondary schools. *African Journal of Education and Practice*, *9*(4), 51-64.
- Basoz, T. & Cubukcu, F. (2014). Pre-service EFL teachers' attitudes computer assisted language learning. *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 116: 531-535.
- Chiang, M. H. (2020). Exploring the effects of digital storytelling: A case study of adult L2 writers in Taiwan. *IAFOR Journal of Education*, *8*, 65-82.
- Demirbilek, N. (2023). Teachers' and school administrators' perceptions of emergency distance education. *Education and Information Technologies*, *28*, 8335-8355.
- Filani, I. (2014). Computer assisted language learning: Implications for English language learning in Nigerian public universities. In O. Taiwo & A. Olayiwola (Eds.), *Globalising the local: African languages and cultures at the border of technology* (pp. 372-385). Crown Goldmine Communications.

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN**: <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

- Garcia-Sanchez, M.S. & Burbules, N.C. (2016). Learning technologies and EFL teamwork. *Revista de Lenguas para Fines Espeficicos*, 22,100-115.
- Kafryawan, W. (2023). The effectiveness of computer assisted language learning by smart phones to increase English proficiency of Papuan EFL students. *Academic Journal of English Language and Education*, 7(1), 217-230.
- Kim, H.Y. (2022). CALL teacher training and knowledge development. International Journal of Educational Research. *116*(3), 102077.
- Njoku, J.C. (2017). English language, the Nigerian education system and human development. *Unizik Journal of Arts and Humanities*, 211-226.
- Obiakor, T.E. (2024). Language of instruction policy in Nigeria: Assessing implementation and literacy achievement in a multilingual environment. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 109: 1-16.
- Okah-Tim, E.J. (2023). Impact of computer-based tests on the quality of education in Nigeria. *International Journal of Information Technology and Computer Engineering*, *3*(3), 6-14.
- Okpala, N. V. (2023). Problems of learning and teaching of English language among senior secondary school students in Nigeria: Implication for post-Covid development. *Sapientia Journal of Education, Sciences and Gender Studies*, *5*(1), 247-257.
- Olibie, E.I. (2010). Using computer assisted language learning to improve students' English language achievement in universal basic education. *International Journal of Educational Research and Technology*, 1(1), 67-71.
- Oribabor (2014). The problems and prospects of teaching English language in Ife Central Local Government of Osun State.
- Parvin, R.H. & Salam, S.F. (2015). The effectiveness of using technology in English language classrooms in government primary schools in Bangladesh. *FIRE: Forum for International Research in Education*, *2*, 47-59.
- Pathan, H., Memon, R., Memon, S., Khoso, A.R. & Buzz, I. (2018). A critical review of Vygotsky's sociocultural theory in language acquisition. *International Journal of English Linguistics*, 8(4), 232-236.
- Shadiev, R. & Wang, X. (2022). A review of research on technology-supported language learning and twenty-first century skills. *Front Psychol.* 7:13:897689.

Vol.02, No.02, 2024: December :265-293, **E-ISSN:** <u>2988-1641</u> https://jolcc.org/index.php/jolcc/index

- Singh, X. P. (2015). The history and the current status of computer assisted language learning. *The Journal of English Language Teaching, LVII*(5), 25-35.
- Tafazoli, D., Parra, M.E. & Huertas-Abril, C.A. (2019). A cross-cultural qualitative study on students' attitudes towards computer-assisted language learning. *The Qualitative Report*, *27*(7), 1841-1855.
- Yamazaki, K. (2014). Toward integrative CALL: A progressive outlook on the history, trends, and issues of CALL. *TAPESTRY*, 6(1), 1-15.
- Zhang, R. & Zou, D. (2020). Types, purposes and state-of-the-art technologies for second and foreign language learning. *Computer Assisted Language Learning*, 1-47.
- Zheltukina, M., Kitsitsyna, N., Sergeeva, O., Knyaseva, S., Polovikov, I. & Tukhvatullina, L. (2023). Trends of cultural studies in science education: A systematic review from 1973 to 2023. *EURASIA Journal of Mathematics, Science and Technology Education*, 19(12), 1-9.